Train-the-Trainers Workshop for Customs Officers on Monitoring & Control of ODS Imports & Exports

Port of Spain, Trinidad, 3-5 October 2000

WORKSHOP REPORT

Train-the-Trainers Workshop for Customs Officers on Monitoring & Control of ODS Imports & Exports

Division of Technology, Industry and Economics

Port of Spain, Trinidad, 3-5 October 2000
WORKSHOP REPORT

Train-the-Trainers Workshop for Customs Officers on Monitoring & Control of ODS Imports & Exports

Port of Spain, Trinidad, 3-5 October 2000

Organized by:

United Nations Environment Programme’s (UNEP DTIE) OzonAction Programme
and the
Environment Management Authority of Trinidad and Tobago (EMA)
in co-operation with the
World Customs Organization (WCO)
with financial support from the
Multilateral Fund for the Implementation of the Montreal Protocol
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Executive Summary</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Background</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Objectives</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Expected results</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Participants and speakers</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Methodology</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Contents and structure of the train-the-trainer workshop</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Results and lessons learned</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Follow-up action plan</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Evaluation by participants</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Annexes</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex 10.1 Agenda</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex 10.2 List of participants</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex 10.3 List of trainers and speakers</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex 10.4 Workshop recommendations</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex 10.5 Evaluation by participants</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Executive Summary

The training programme for customs officers is part of Trinidad & Tobago’s Refrigerant Management Plan (RMP) - a comprehensive and integrated strategy to phase-out the use of ozone-depleting substances (ODS) in the refrigeration and air-conditioning sector.

The main objective of the training programme is to provide the customs officers and relevant stakeholders with the skills necessary to monitor and control the imports and exports of ODSs and products (including equipment) containing them as well as detecting and preventing illegal trade.

The programme consists of three phases, the train-the-customs-trainers phase, the train-the-customs-officers phase and the monitoring & evaluation phase. The trained customs trainers are expected to train 400 customs officers in Trinidad & Tobago.

The train-the-customs-trainers workshop in Trinidad & Tobago is the second workshop of its kind in the world to be implemented as part of a national RMP. The first workshop was held in Jamaica in June 2000 and similar workshops will be held in more than 40 other developing countries.

The preparation of the workshop required the development of the "Trinidad & Tobago Handbook on ODS Legislation and Import / Export Licensing System" which was prepared by the national Ozone Officer and a local legal consultant. The document complements the UNEP training manual “Customs Officers Training on Substances Depleting the Ozone Layer” by providing country-specific information and data. Local presenters contributed additional training materials.

The immediate result of the train-the-customs-trainers workshop is the availability of 19 trained customs trainers, customs officers and other relevant stakeholders and the inclusion of a Montreal Protocol related training module in the training curricula for new customs officers.

The long term result of the training programme is to enhance awareness of ozone depletion issues among customs officers and other relevant stakeholders and to enable customs officers to enforce the import / export licensing system for ODS and products (including equipment) containing or using them. The control of virgin ODS entering the country, following the phase-out schedules under the Montreal Protocol, will lead to increased prices of ozone depleting refrigerants and make the recovery & recycling (R&R) system economically viable.

The workshop included presentations by high-level Government representatives during the opening and closing sessions. Media coverage included television interviews and coverage of the opening ceremony on the two national television stations and in newspaper articles.

The design of the train-the-customs-trainers workshop followed an interactive and participatory approach and involved 9 local presenters. Two case studies on smuggling schemes were presented to test participants to test their knowledge of what they had learned throughout the
workshop and four small working groups were created during the break-out session in order to discuss specific topics.

During a group discussion participants planned Phase II and III of the training programme and prepared detailed recommendations, a tentative concept note, agenda and implementation schedule.

Future challenges for customs authorities in enforcing international environmental agreements such as the Basel Convention, CITES, Kyoto Protocol, the Rotterdam Convention and the Lusaka Agreement were discussed and scope for synergies identified. Local presenters emphasised that special training for customs authorities is needed and that such training should be co-ordinated between the different Convention Secretariats.

The participants conducted a workshop evaluation (see Annex 10.5) and agreed a final set of recommendations (see Annex 10.4). The overall evaluation of the workshop was "excellent" (45%) and "good" (55%).

The workshop report will be disseminated to the workshop participants and speakers as well as members of the contact group on customs training. It will also be placed on UNEP's homepage at: http://www.uneptie.org/ozonaction.html

1. Background

In most developing countries, the largest remaining sector in which ozone-depleting substances are still used is the refrigeration and air-conditioning servicing sector. In 1996, Trinidad & Tobago consumed approximately 95 ODP tonnes of ozone-depleting substances (ODS) in the refrigeration & air-conditioning sector. Trinidad & Tobago imports all its ODSs. All CFC-based appliances are imported into the country already assembled. Any abrupt non-availability of CFC refrigerants will adversely impact on important sectors of the local economy. It is therefore essential for CFC users to be able to reduce and subsequently phase-out their consumption in a co-ordinated, planned and cost-effective manner.

The Refrigerant Management Plan of Trinidad & Tobago was approved by the 23rd Meeting of the Executive Committee of the Multilateral Fund. It is to be jointly implemented by UNDP and UNEP. The Plan is a comprehensive approach to phase out the use of ozone-depleting refrigerants.

UNEP’s role is to co-ordinate the implementation of the two training elements of the Refrigerant Management Plan:

- The training programme on good practices in refrigeration
- The training programme for customs officers on control and monitoring of ODS imports and exports.
The ability of customs officers to enforce controls over trade in CFCs and products containing them is an important element in Trinidad & Tobago’s phase-out strategy. Thus, UNEP will provide the means through which Trinidad & Tobago will train its customs officers to meet this challenge.

2. Objectives

The main objective of this training programme is to provide the customs officers in Trinidad & Tobago with the skills necessary to monitor and control the imports and exports of CFCs and other ODSs as well as products containing them. The detection and prevention of illegal trade is part of this effort. This will be achieved by:

I. Increasing awareness of ozone depletion issues;
II. Familiarizing customs officers with the different types of ODS being used in the sector and for which applications;
III. Familiarizing customs officers with the provisions and phase-out schedules of the Montreal Protocol and its Amendments;
IV. Providing officers with an understanding of the national Refrigerant Management Plan;
V. Providing an overview on the newly established licensing system for ODS and its implications for customs officers;
VI. Presenting the revised customs codes which allow for the identification of ozone-depleting refrigerants and products containing them;
VII. Refining and optimizing the operational details of the monitoring and control system for ODS in Trinidad & Tobago;
VIII. Providing an overview of customs regulations and monitoring and control systems for ODS in other Caribbean countries;
IX. Training customs officers in the use of identification equipment for refrigerants;
X. Designing the concept, agenda, strategy and the time schedule for the training of the remaining customs officers in the country.

3. Expected results

The immediate result of the training programme will be the availability of trained customs trainers and the development of a concept, agenda and strategy for Phase II of the training programme - the subsequent training of the remaining customs officers in Trinidad & Tobago. Further customs officers and stakeholders involved in the operation and enforcement of the licensing system will also be trained (see Section 4).

The long-term result is to enhance awareness of ozone depletion issues among customs officers and to provide them with the information and skills necessary to implement import / export licensing systems to control trade with ODS. In addition, a Montreal Protocol related training module will be included in the training curriculum for new customs officers as well as in refresher courses for experienced officers.
4. Participants

In total 19 participants attended the train-the-customs-trainers workshop. They were 10 customs officers from the training and other sections of the customs department from around the country, as well as 9 key stakeholders from national agencies whose involvement and support is necessary for the successful implementation of the import/export licensing system.

The 9 stakeholders came from the following agencies and company: the Ministry of Trade & Industry, the Ministry of the Environment, the Trinidad & Tobago Bureau of Standards, the Pesticides and Toxic Chemicals Control Board of the Ministry of Health, Ministry of the Attorney General, and West Indies Tobacco Company.

The list of workshop participants is attached as Annex 10.2.

The participants in Phase II of the training programme will be the remaining customs officers of the country.

The instructors for the workshop was:

    Ms. Brittany Whiting of Concurrent Technologies Corporation.

Additional resource persons were:

    Mr. Kenneth Boodoo, Manager, Commercial Air-Conditioning Department, Thomas Peake & Co. Ltd.
    Mrs. Nadra Nathai-Gyan, Wildlife Section, Forestry Division, Ministry of Agriculture, Land and Marine Resources
    Mr. Michael Harris, Ozone Officer, Environmental Management Authority
    Mr. Fitzroy John, Legal Consultant, Customs & Excise Office
    Mr. Kishan Kumarsingh, Technical Co-ordinator, Environmental Management Authority
    Mrs. Sharon Laurent, Unit Leader (Environmental Unit), CARIRI (Caribbean Regional Centre for Implementation of the Basel Convention)
    Mr. Bishnu Tulsie, Local Co-ordinator Caribbean, UNEP DTIE

Additional speakers during the opening and closing sessions included:

    Mr. K. Doopan, Comptroller, Trinidad & Tobago Customs
    Dr. Dave McIntosh, Environmental Management Authority
    Dr. Vincent Moe, Chairman, Environmental Management Authority

The list of trainers and speakers is attached as Annex 10.3 and the agenda is attached as Annex 10.1.
5. Methodology

The training programme will be implemented in three phases:

Phase I: Train-the-customs-trainers workshop
Phase II: Subsequent training of the remaining customs officers in the country
Phase III: Monitoring & evaluation

Phase I: Train-the-customs-trainers workshop

The train-the-customs-trainers workshop in Trinidad & Tobago is the second workshop of its kind in the world to be implemented as part of a national RMP. The first workshop was held in Jamaica in June 2000 and similar workshops will be held in more than 40 other developing countries.

The preparation of the workshop required the development of the "Trinidad & Tobago Handbook on ODS Legislation and Import / Export Licensing System" which was prepared by the national Ozone Officer and a local legal consultant. The document complements the UNEP training manual "Customs Officers Training on Substances Depleting the Ozone Layer" by providing country-specific information and data. Local presenters contributed additional training materials.

The immediate result of the train-the-customs-trainers workshop is the availability of 19 trained customs trainers and other relevant stakeholders and the inclusion of a Montreal Protocol related training module in the training curricula for new customs officers.

The long term result of the training programme is to enhance awareness of ozone depletion issues among customs officers and other relevant stakeholders and to enable customs officers to enforce the import / export licensing system for ODS and products (including equipment) containing or using them. The control of virgin ODS entering the country, following the phase-out schedules under the Montreal Protocol, will lead to increased prices of ozone depleting refrigerants and make the recovery & recycling (R&R) system economically viable.

The workshop included presentations by high-level Government representatives during the opening and closing sessions. Media coverage included television interviews and coverage of the opening ceremony on the two national television stations and in newspaper articles.

The UNEP customs training manual, the "Trinidad & Tobago Handbook and other relevant resource documents were handed out to the participants. Additional documents and examples of ODS-containing products and equipment were displayed at the conference centre. The UNEP video "Every Action Counts" was shown to the participants.

The design of the train-the-customs-trainers workshop followed an interactive and participatory approach and involved 9 local presenters. Two case studies on smuggling schemes were presented to test participants to test their knowledge of what they had learned throughout the
workshop and four small working groups were created during the break-out session in order to discuss specific topics.

Group 1 discussed the operational details of the ODS import / export licensing system, Group 2 the enforcement of ODS regulations, Group 3 public education and Group 4 information exchange between relevant agencies. Each group prepared a reports with their findings and recommendations.

During a group discussion participants planned Phase II and III of the training programme and prepared detailed recommendations, a tentative concept note, agenda and implementation schedule.

A practical hands-on session was included in the programme to identify different types of refrigerants, using the pressure-temperature method, leak detector and digital refrigerant identifier. Product and packaging labelling was checked. The National Ozone Unit made available a refrigerant identification kit for demonstration purposes.

Wrap-up sessions concluded the day's discussions. The participants conducted a workshop evaluation and agreed a final set of recommendations (see Annex 10.4).

Each participant received a “Certificate of Participation” from the Government of Trinidad & Tobago and was registered at the end of the workshop. It is proposed that this training and certification should become mandatory for all customs officers.

The workshop report will be disseminated to all participants and members of the contact group on customs training. It will also be placed on UNEP's homepage at: [http://www.uneptie.org/ozonaction.html](http://www.uneptie.org/ozonaction.html)

**Phase II: Training of the remaining customs officers in the country**

The trained-customs-trainers will train the remaining customs officers in the country. This training will follow the concept, agenda and time schedule developed during the trainers’ workshop. In addition, experienced customs officers may receive training on ozone-related issues as part of the continuous customs re-training programme.

The National Ozone Unit and the local consultant will, in close collaboration with the Customs department, be responsible for the definition of a specific timetable for the training of the remaining customs officers in the country.

**Phase III: Monitoring & evaluation**

The National Ozone Unit will co-ordinate, monitor and follow-up on the training activities during Phase II of the training programme and report progress in project implementation to UNEP.
After completion of Phase II of the training programme, the NOU will evaluate the results of the training programme and to prepare a follow-up & evaluation report. This report will be submitted to UNEP.

6. Contents and structure of the train-the-trainers workshop

The training materials were designed to ensure that the objectives set out for the workshop (see Section 2) were achieved.

The workshop included the following sessions:

Session 1: Ozone Layer Depletion
Session 2: International Response
Session 3: National Obligations and Response
Session 4: National Import / Export Licensing System
Session 5: Checking Papers, Forms and Permits
Session 6: Global & Regional Context
Session 7: Role of Customs Officers and Other Key Stakeholders
Session 8: Illegal trade with ODS and ODS-containing Equipment and Goods
Session 9: Identification of ODS and ODS-containing Equipment
Session 10: Safe Handling, Transport and Storage of ODS
Session 11: Practical Exercises on Identification of ODS
Session 12: Related International Conventions
Session 13: Breakout Session on Effective Operation of ODS Import / Export Licensing System and Enforcement of ODS Regulations
Session 14: Action Planning for Phase II and III of the Customs Training
Session 15: Workshop Evaluation

7. Results and lessons learned

The objectives set out for the workshop have been fully met through the appropriate design of the workshop agenda whose 15 workshop sessions addressed all relevant issues. A detailed evaluation of the most relevant issues is included in Annex 10.5.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OBJECTIVES SET OUT</th>
<th>RESULTS ACHIEVED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Increasing awareness of ozone depletion issues</td>
<td>Fully - through Sessions 1, 7 and UNEP video “Every Action Counts”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Familiarizing customs officers with the different types of ODS being used in the sector and for which applications</td>
<td>Fully - through Sessions 1, 3, 4, 9, 10, 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Familiarizing customs officers with the provisions and phase-out schedules of the Montreal Protocol and its Amendments</td>
<td>Fully – through Sessions 2, 3, 4.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
IV. Providing officers with an understanding of the national Refrigerant Management Plan

V. Providing an overview on the newly established licensing system for ODS and its implications for customs officers

VI. Presenting the revised customs codes which allow for the identification of ozone-depleting refrigerants and products containing them

VII. Refining and optimizing the operational details of the monitoring and control system for ODS in Trinidad & Tobago

VIII. Providing an overview of customs regulations and monitoring and control systems for ODS in other Caribbean countries

IX. Training customs officers in the use of identification equipment for refrigerants

X. Designing the concept, agenda, strategy and the time schedule for the training of the remaining customs officers in the country.

In addition, the follow specific outcomes could be achieved:

- Successful training and certification of 19 participants on monitoring and controlling of imports and exports of ODS and ODS-containing products (including equipment) in Trinidad & Tobago
- Demonstrating methods for the inspection of imported refrigerators, motor vehicles, compressors, the identification of refrigerants and the checking of freight papers and labelling. The practical demonstrations included the use of a leak detector, a digital refrigerant identifier and the temperature/pressure method.
- Exchange of information and experiences between the participants and development of a network of personal contacts.
- The “Trinidad & Tobago Handbook” will be used for the further training of customs officers.
- Detailed workshop recommendations by the participants (see Annex 10.4).
- Certification of the participants by Government of Trinidad & Tobago.

The following lessons were learned from the train-the-customs-trainers workshop:

- The local organisation was excellent. The support staff ensured that recommendations were typed, copied and handed out to participants during the workshop. The classroom was well equipped. ODS containers, refrigerators, refrigerator and motor vehicle compressors were available for viewing by participants.
- Participants were interested in the science of ozone depletion. More time could be devoted to explaining the science. Understanding the health and environmental effects of ozone depletion made participants more committed to their jobs in enforcing the import / export licensing system in Trinidad & Tobago.
- The slides presented on ozone science were extremely helpful for participants to understand the process of ozone layer depletion.
- The participants found the case studies presented in session 8 very helpful. It is suggested that each country develop at least two local case study examples prior to the workshop for training purposes.
- Participants liked the Session 12 on “Related International Conventions”, but would have preferred to hear this information after the session on the “Montreal Protocol”.
- Break-out session on the effective operation of the import/export licensing system, enforcing ODS regulation, public education, and information exchange was well received by participants.
- More emphasis should be placed on data reporting in the session on “National Obligations”.
- The recommendations from the participants are included as Annex 10.4.

8. Follow-up action plan

This training programme is part of the RMP for Trinidad & Tobago. As such it will be accompanied by other training and policy related activities as defined in the RMP.

The NOU will establish a monitoring mechanism to ensure that the objectives of the training programme are met and will produce a follow-up report on the status of implementation of the training programme. If Phase II of the training programme is not completed 12 months after the train-the-trainers workshop, an intermediate follow-up report needs to be prepared, following the UNEP standard format for follow-up reports.

The National Ozone Unit will consider and, as far as possible, implement the workshop recommendations as adopted by the workshop participants (see Annex 10.4). The recommendations should also be communicated to the relevant decision-makers and politicians.

9. Evaluation by participants

The overall evaluation of train-the-customs-trainers workshop participation was very good. All participants (100%) returned their evaluation questionnaire. Out of the 19 evaluations, 8 participants rated the workshop as “good” (42%) and 11 as “excellent” (58%).

A graphic analysis of the received evaluation questionnaires is included in Annex 10.5.

The following section includes feedback and suggestions received from the workshop participants concerning (a) the workshop itself, (b) the UNEP customs training manual and (c) the “Trinidad Handbook”:

(a) Phase I customs training

- Time allocation should be increased, particularly in the session on “Ozone Science” to better understand the mechanisms and impacts of ozone depletion.
- More time needs to be allocated for discussion and working group sessions.
- Provision of more time will be of great help.
- Evidence of tremendous research and work in preparation.
- Quality of the course quite excellent.
- The course can be greatly enhanced by allotting more time to the science of ozone depletion.
- Excellent information disseminated.
- Being geared towards customs personnel, other customs matters (laws, penalties) could be curtailed.
- Well managed by the facilitators.
- Pleased with the willingness to share knowledge by the participants.

(b) **UNEP customs training manual**

- More technical knowledge of ODS.
- Only on-the-job training & experiences will complete this programme.
- Copy of Montreal Protocol (major provisions and regulations).
- More feedback with reference to what is presently taking place within the region.
- Specimen of the Material Safety Data Sheet.

(c) **TRINIDAD & TOBAGO Handbook on ODS Legislation**

- Inclusion of the Material Safety Data Sheets.
- List of relevant standards (local & international).
- There should have been reference to the silence of the law on export of ODS.
- There are too many departments, which issue licenses for the importation / exportation of controlled substances which may not be known by every officer. A single document should advise the various requirements for imports / exports of such substances, available to officers and the public.
- More information on the role of other stakeholders should be included with respect to their relationship with customs.
- A list of major importers of ODS.

10. Annexes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Annex 10.1</th>
<th>Agenda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Annex 10.2</td>
<td>List of Participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex 10.3</td>
<td>List of Trainers/Speakers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex 10.4</td>
<td>Workshop Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex 10.5</td>
<td>Evaluation by Participants</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ANNEX 10.1 Agenda

Day 1

8:30 Registration

9:00 Opening Ceremony and Media Briefing

Welcome Address and Opening Statement
Mr. Michael Harris – Chairman

UNEP DTIE’s OzonAction Programme
Mr. Bishnu Tulsie, Local Co-ordinator Caribbean, UNEP DTIE

The Training Team and Workshop Approach
Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, Concurrent Technologies Corporation

Workshop Address by Customs Representative
Mr. K. Doopan, Comptroller, Trinidad & Tobago Customs

Welcome Address and Opening Statement
Dr. Vincent Moe, Chairman, Environmental Management Authority

Closing Remarks
Mr. Michael Harris

10:00 Break

10:15 Introduction:
Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC

- Expected output of the training programme
- Training materials and display
- Self-introduction of participants

10:45 Session 1: Ozone Layer Depletion
Mr. Bishnu Tulsie, Local Co-ordinator Caribbean, UNEP DTIE

- Environmental and human health consequences
- UNEP video: Every Action Counts
- Ozone layer science
- Discussion

11:15 Break
11:30  **Session 2: International Response**  
*Mr. Bishnu Tulsie, Local Co-ordinator Caribbean, UNEP DTIE*

- International response - the Montreal Protocol and its Amendments
- Phase-out schedule and strategies for Article 2 and Article 5 countries
- Discussion

12:00  **Session 3: National Obligations and Response**  
*Mr. Michael Harris, Ozone Officer, EMA*

- Overview of national ODS consumption pattern
- National phase-out obligations
- National response - Refrigerant Management Plan
- Discussion

13:00  Lunch

14:00  **Session 4: National Import/Export Licensing System**  
*Mr. Fitzroy John, Legal Consultant*

- Institutional framework
- National ODS regulations
- Structure of national import/export licensing system
- Institutional arrangements and procedures to manage the system
- Import quotas and application for permits and allowances
- Information to importers, wholesalers and end-users
- Handling of seized ODS and ODS-containing equipment and goods
- Enforcement and penalties
- Forms introduced by the licensing system
- Discussion

15:45  Break

16:00  **Session 5: Checking Papers, Forms and Permits**  
*Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC*  
*Mr. Fitzroy John, Legal Consultant*

- Logistics and data management
- Application forms, permit forms, freight papers, retrofit certificates etc.
- Practical exercise on checking freight papers and permits
- Discussion

17:00  **Wrap-up Sessions and Workshop Recommendations**  
*Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC*
Day 2

9:00 Session 6: Global and Regional Context
Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC
Mr. Fitzroy John, Legal Consultant

- Global production and trade with ODS and ODS-containing products
- Transshipment harbors, production, disposal, reclaim facilities in the region
- Regional and global trade agreements
- Implementation of revised HS codes in the region (Mr. Fitzroy John)
- Impact on trade and economy
- Discussion

9:45 Session 7: Role of Customs Officers and Other Key Stakeholders
Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC

- Key players in monitoring and control imports / exports of ODS and ODS-containing equipment and goods (customs, coast guard, police, court, chemistry laboratory, importers/wholesalers, end-users, NOU etc)
- Reporting legal and illegal trade with ODS and ODS-containing products
- Enforcing ODS legislation
- Checklist for customs officers
- Discussion

10:15 Break

10:30 Session 8: Illegal Trade with ODS and ODS-containing Products, Equipment and Goods
Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC

- Legal and illegal trade with Parties and non-Parties
- Detecting legal and illegal trade at local, regional and international level
- Trade with recycled, recovered, reclaimed or contaminated refrigerants
- Causes and trends of illegal trade
- Methods of smuggling
- Prevention of illegal trade
- Case study on illegal trade
- Discussion

12:00 Lunch

13:00 Session 9: Identification of ODS and ODS-containing Products, Equipment and Goods
Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC
- Harmonized System codes for pure and mixed ODS
- Common trade names for ODSs, including CFCs, HCFCs, methyl bromide, halons, solvents, foams, aerosols etc.
- CAS numbers, ASHRAE numbers, UN numbers etc.
- Examples of labeling for ODS and color codes
- Examples of labeling of ODS-containing equipment and goods
- Detection of mislabeled ODS containers, cylinders etc.
- Identification of ODS-containing equipment and goods
- Use of refrigerant identifiers (theory)
- Discussion

14:30 Session 10: Safe Handling, Transport and Storage of ODS
Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC

- ODS chemical information relevant to customs officers
- Safe handling of ODS and ODS-containing products
- Safe transport and storage of ODS and ODS-containing products
- Safe sampling of ODS - who is allowed to take samples and to use refrigerant identifiers
- Discussion

15:00 Break

15:15 Session 11: Practical Exercises on Identification of ODS
Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC
Mr. Kenneth Boodoo, Thomas Peake & Co. Ltd.

- Examples of ODS containers and cylinders and ODS-containing equipment and goods
- Hands-on work with CFC detection equipment if available
- Identification of ODS-containing products, equipment and goods

Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC

- In addition to two key topics, participants may suggest 2 additional topics of interest:
  Topic 1: How to effectively operate ODS import / export licensing systems
  Topic 2: How to effectively enforce ODS regulations
  Topic 3: To be suggested by participants
  Topic 4: To be suggested by participants

17:00 Wrap-up Session and Workshop Recommendations
Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC
Day 3

9:00 Session 12: Related International Conventions

- Kyoto Protocol (global warming) by Mr. Kishan Kumarsingh, Technical Coordinator, Environmental Management Authority
- Basel Convention by Ms. Sharon Laurent, Representative of the Implementation the Basel Convention located at CARIRI
- Rotterdam Convention (prior informed consent) by Mr. Bishnu Tulsie, Local Coordinator Caribbean, UNEP DTIE
- Common features related to the control of trade and synergies for customs authorities for effective enforcement
- Discussion

9:45 Break-out Session 13: Effective Operation of ODS Import / Export Licensing System and Enforcement of ODS Regulations

Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC

- Group moderators will co-ordinate the break-out sessions.

11:15 Break

- Group moderators will ensure the preparation of a short report and presentation of their findings including the group recommendations.

11:45 Break-out Session 13: Presentation of Findings of the Group Work to the Plenary

Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC

- Hand-over of reports to the lead consultant
- Presentation of group recommendations to the plenary (10 min per group)
- Discussion and adoption of group recommendations (5 min per group)
- Feedback on the break-out session

13:00 Lunch

14:00 Session 14: Action Planning for Phase II and III of the Customs Training

Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC

- How to design Phase II of the customs training (approach, duration, agenda, schedule, trainers, participants etc.)
- Which training materials should be used for Phase II of the customs training and what should be the key contents of the training
- How to ensure timely implementation, monitoring and reporting during Phase II & III
- Discussion

15:00 Session 15: Workshop Evaluation
Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC

- Completion of evaluation questionnaires
- General feedback and comments from participants and organisers

15:45 Break

16:00 Closing Session and Media Briefing

Conclusions and Outlook
Mr. Michael Harris, Ozone Officer, EMA

Conclusions on Synergies on Co-operation between related Conventions
Mr. Bishnu Tulsie, Local Co-ordinator Caribbean, UNEP DTIE

Closing Remarks
Ms. Brittany Whiting, Trainer, CTC

Hand-over of Participation Certificates
Dr. Dave McIntosh, Environmental Management Authority

Closing Remarks by Customs Representative
Mr. Inniss Charles, Training Supervisor

Closing of Workshop
Mr. Michael Harris, Ozone Officer, EMA
ANNEX 10.2  List of Participants

Mr. Edwin Charles
Customs & Excise Officer 111
Customs & Excise Division
Abercromby Street & Independence Square
PORT OF SPAIN.
Telephone: 679-4073/4074

Mr. Inniss Charles
Ag. Supervisor, Training
Customs & Excise Division
Abercromby Street & Independence Square
PORT OF SPAIN
Telephone: 627-6631

Mr. Malcolm Farmer
Ag. Training Officer
Customs & Excise Division
Abercromby Street & Independence Square
PORT OF SPAIN.
Telephone: 627-6631

Ms. Bernadine Glasgow
Trade Officer 11
Ministry of Trade & Industry
Riverside Plaza
Besson Street
PORT OF SPAIN.
Telephone: 627-1912

Mr. Reynold Gooding
Customs & Excise Officer 111
Customs & Excise Division
Abercromby Street & Independence Square
PORT OF SPAIN
Telephone: 667-3321

Ms. Jonetta Jeet
Legal Officer 1
Ministry of the Attorney General
Corner Sackville & St. Vincent Streets
PORT OF SPAIN
Telephone: 625-8880 Ext. 2423
E-mail: jeetjon@hotmail.com

Mr. Curtis John
Customs and Excise Officer 1
Customs & Excise Division
Abercromby Street & Independence Square
PORT OF SPAIN
Telephone: 636-0667

Mr. Kenneth Kerr
Ag. Registrar
Pesticides & Toxic Chemical Control Board
92 Frederick Street
PORT OF SPAIN.
Telephone: 623-7544/623-5242
Fax: 623-2477

Ms. Jennifer Knights
Customs and Excise Officer 11
Customs & Excise Division
Abercromby Street & Independence Square
PORT OF SPAIN.
Telephone: 645-0003

Mr. Frederick Lewis
Supervisor Warehouses
Customs & Excise Division
Abercromby Street & Independence Square
PORT OF SPAIN
Telephone: 625-3311

Mr. William Murray
Standards Officer 11 (Implementation)
Trinidad & Tobago Bureau of Standards,
Trincity Industrial Estate,
TRINCITY.
Telephone: 662-8827
Fax: (868) 663-4335
Ms. June Ragbirsingh-Chang
Environmental Research Analyst
Ministry of the Environment
Level 16, Eric Williams Financial Complex
Independence Square
PORT OF SPAIN.
Telephone: 627-9700 Ext. 4208
Fax: 625-1585
Email: june_chang@hotmail.com

Mr. Bhim Ramnath
Customs & Excise Officer 11
Customs & Excise Division
Abercromby Street & Independence Square
PORT OF SPAIN
Telephone: 624-2811
Fax: 625-4138

Ms. Emryn Richardson
Trade Officer 111
Ministry of Trade & Industry
Riverside Plaza
Besson Street
PORT OF SPAIN.
Telephone: 623-2931-4
Fax: 627-8488

Ms. Shallima Shah
Customs and Excise Officer 11
Customs & Excise Division
Abercromby Street & Independence Square
PORT OF SPAIN
Telephone: 673-0337

Ms. Gale Alleyne-Sinclair
Trade Officer 1
Ministry of Trade and Industry
Riverside Plaza
Besson Street
PORT OF SPAIN
Telephone: 652-2371
Email: gdastro@yahoo.com

Mr. Errol Skerritt
Customs & Excise Officer 111
Customs & Excise Division
Abercromby Street & Independence Square
PORT OF SPAIN
Telephone: 624-5255

Ms. Marjorie Stephens-Smith
Environmental, Health and Safety Co-ordinator
WITCO
Mt. Dor Champs Fleurs
P.O. Box 177
PORT OF SPAIN.
Telephone: 662-2271 Ext. 312
Fax: 645-5101

Mr. Fidellis Toussaint
Standards Officer 1
Trinidad & Tobago Bureau of Standards,
Trincity Industrial Estate,
TRINCITY
Telephone: 662-8827 Ext. 119
Fax: 663-4335
Email: fidellis@wwdg.com
ANNEX 10.3 List of Trainers & Speakers

**Mr. Kenneth Boodoo**
Manager, Commercial Air- Conditioning Department
Thomas Peake & Company Limited
Western Main Road
COCORITE, Trinidad
Telephone: 622-4293
Fax: 622-4295

**Ms. Nadra Nathai-Gyan**
Wildlife Section, Forestry Division,
Ministry of Agriculture, Land and Marine Resources
Farm Road
St. Joseph, Trinidad
Telephone: 662-5114
Fax: 645-4288
Email: wildlife@trinidad.net

**Mr. Fitzroy A. John**
Legal Officer
Customs & Excise Division
Abercromby Street & Independence Square
PORT OF SPAIN, Trinidad
Telephone: 625-4131

**Mr. Kishan Kumarsingh**
Technical Co-ordinator
Environmental Management Authority
16 Queen’s Park West
PORT OF SPAIN, Trinidad
Telephone: 628-8042; Ext. 257
Fax: 628-9122
Email: kkumarsingh@ema.co.tt

**Ms. Sharon Laurent**
Unit Leader (Environmental Unit)
CARIRI (Caribbean Regional Centre for Implementation of the Basel Convention)
Telephone: 662-7171
Fax: 662-7177
Email: cariri@carib-link.net

**Mr. Michael Harris**
Ozone Officer
Environmental Management Authority
2nd Floor, Mutual Centre
16 Queen’s Park West
Port of Spain, Trinidad & Tobago
Tel: (1868) 628-8042
Fax: (1868) 628-9122/628-9123
Email: mharris@ema.co.tt

**Mr. Bishnu Tulsie**
Local Co-ordinator Caribbean UNEP DTIE
P.O. Box 709
Castries
St. Lucia
Telephone: (758) 451 8746
Fax: (758) 452 2506
Email: btulsie@candw.lc

**Ms. Brittany Whiting**
International Program Manager/Trainer
Concurrent Technologies Corporation (CTC)
1300 Pennsylvania Ave., NW Suite 200
Washington, DC 20004
USA
Tel: (1202)-312-2941
Fax: (1202)-312-2925
Email: whitingb@ctc.com
ANNEX 10.4 Workshop Recommendations

1. The following workshop recommendations were discussed and approved by all participants during the workshop.

- A Public Awareness and Education campaign was thought to be necessary.

- Similar workshop/training seminar should be held for the importers of products, which use CFCs.

- Ministry of Consumer Affairs should be involved in the workshops.

- It was stated that a policy of publishing a list of importers and users of ODS be made available. It was expressed that there was a need to establish databases so that information can accessed.

- Regulation regarding “roll-on-roll-off” vehicles is 5 years. However, no legislation is in place for returning residents who bring vehicles older than five years, into the country. Therefore, there is the problem of vehicles with CFC-based air-conditioning coming into the country.

- Recycling centers will eventually have a surplus of contaminated gas, which cannot be dealt with. What will become of this? If gases are vented, then the process will be defeated. Solution to this issue must be viewed by Trinidad & Tobago and addressed by the Montreal Protocol.

- Transshipment - current laws do not mandate that ODS must be specifically mentioned – it can be regarded as “general cargo” on a vessel. Laws must be amended to reflect this so that the monitoring process can be subsequently enhanced. Provision for “hazardous cargo” should be put in place and ODS may be on this list.

- Problem with storage - the Port Authority of Trinidad & Tobago not interested in following through with this. As a result, there are no special storage facilities for hazardous substances.

- Parties need to address the question of disposal of seized ODS and products containing them as well as excess recovered gas and contaminated gas that cannot be used.

- Specialist publication that lists UN#, CAS# and ASHRAE# numbers should be provided.

- To be added to safety checklist: Importance of having medical examinations if exposed to ODS. This is not a legal requirement but it should implemented (medical examination at least once per year).
Public education programmes should be put in place to prevent the reuse of refrigerant cylinders as barbecue pits.

2. The following recommendations have been made by the different working groups during the break-out session:

GROUP 1 – HOW TO EFFECTIVELY OPERATE THE ODS IMPORT/EXPORT LICENSING SYSTEM

- Customs forms should have proper HS classification, chemical name and customs documents.
- ODS and products containing them should be properly described on customs documents.
- License should also include exports.
- Description of returns on quantity of ODS should be done on a monthly basis.
- ODS and products containing them should be specifically mentioned on ship manifest.
- Database should be made available of manufacturers of ozone-friendly products as well as of manufacturers of ODS and products containing them.
- Licensing authorities should keep Customs Authorities informed about any development.

Group 2 – ODS ENFORCEMENT

- Massive education drive for:
  - Customs Officers
  - Brokers
  - Consumers.
- Insist on precise description of goods
- Invoice, manifest, bill of entry, bill of lading.
- Require MSDS for importation of chemicals.
- Require labeling on physical items.
- Provide equipment for testing.
- Establish database of import / exports – profiling.
- Pass occupational healthy & safety bill.
- Laws have “teeth” for other agencies.
- Establish transshipment designated area for ODS storage
- Notify Trinidad & Tobago authorities of transshipments of ODS and inform on final destination.
- Encourage integration of International Environmental Agreements.
- Introduce salary reform to avoid bribes.
- Establish health medical plan including examinations for personnel exposed to chemicals
- Ratification of WTO agreement.

GROUP 3 – PUBLIC EDUCATION
- Collaborative effort of public relations agencies of Trinidad & Tobago on educating consumers through electronic and print media. The Ministry of Health and NGOs should be involved in this education effort.
- Schools, pre-schools, technical and tertiary schools should be targeted by the Ministry of Education and the Environmental Management Authority.
- Ongoing specialized training should be provided to industry, police, Customs brokers and firemen.

GROUP 4 – INFORMATION EXCHANGE

- Get commitment of departments / teams.
- Develop awareness on ODS issues.
- Promote training.
- Organize regular meetings in department and include Customs.
- Re-examine document procedure flow.
- Establish working group for further HS classification.
- Get in contact with CARICOM and exchange information.
- Establish mechanism to ensure commitment.

3. The following recommendations have been agreed for Phase II & III of the training programme for customs officers:

Audience:  
- All customs officers
- Part of induction course

Purpose:  
- Properly identify ODS
- Educate them about the Montreal Protocol
- Ozone layer overview
- Discussing other conventions / protocols
- Appreciate the work of other agencies
- Existing Laws in Trinidad & Tobago
- Becoming familiar with the Smuggling Methods

Intended Result:  
- To ensure that ODS is as important as other restricted items
- Modify and expand examinations techniques

Duration:  
- Formal - 2 day training
- Informal on the job training

Agenda:  
- Broad overview of international conventions & local laws
- More time on ozone science - video presentations
- Reduce the time covering classification
- Practical session
- Develop local case study examples
- Talk about import / export licensing system
- Enforcement – review of documentation
- Safety & health on ODS
- Group work session – use this for case study examples
- Handling and storage
- Overview of ODS names
- Customs obligations to other agencies (e.g. reporting) – Trade, EMA, Health, TTBS
- Evaluation

Hidden Agenda: - Quiz / test

Resources: Refreshments

Human Resources:  
- Trainers that attended the current workshop
- Training supervisor to determine trainers’ responsibilities

Technical People:  
- Refrigerators – Peakes
- NOU – Mr. Michael Harris
- Fire Services
- Trade
- Legal consultant Mr. John / Mr. Gooding
- Trinidad & Tobago Bureau of Standards
- Health

Support Staff:  
- EMA resources

Physical Resources: - 
- Testing equipment
- Examples of ODS containers and packaging
- Training binder/deskbook for customs officers

Training material: - Trainers to condense global manual & national handbook
- Slides on ozone science

Timely implementation: - Legal consultant Mr. John has delivery schedule

Monitoring: - Evaluation
- Number of trained customs officers

Reporting: - ODS training will be part of a continuous training that Customs has started.
ANNEX 10.5 Evaluation by the Participants

Evaluation Questionnaire

The following questionnaire was given to participants to evaluate the training course. The responses are tabled in a graph in the following page. The rating “1” stands for poor performance and the rating “5” for excellent performance.

1. What is your overall evaluation of the course?
2. Did the course provide the information you expected?
3. Was the communication between participants possible and useful?
4. Was the composition of the audience adequate?
5. As far as the contents of the presentation are concerned, did you find them adequate in explaining the following issues:
   a) Environmental and human health consequences of ozone layer depletion?
   b) International response to ozone layer depletion (Montreal Protocol)?
   c) National obligations and phase-out strategy (RMP)?
   d) Regulatory framework for the national import/export licensing system?
   e) Prevention of illegal trade of ODS?
   f) Role of customs officers in enforcing the import/export licensing system?
   g) Role of other stakeholders in implementing the import/export licensing system?
   h) How to identify ODS and equipment containing ODS and the use of ODS identifying equipment?
   i) Issues relating to safe storage and handling of ODS?
   j) Data reporting requirements and procedures?
   k) Enforcement, penalties and prevention of illegal trade

6. Did the training course provide you with adequate information regarding the subsequent training of the remaining customs officers?
7. Did the training course provide appropriate training material as the basis for the subsequent training of the remaining customs officers?
8. Can you think of any additional material that should be included in the "UNEP Customs Training Manual" to enable it to better achieve its goals?
9. Can you think of any additional material that should be included in the “Trinidad & Tobago Handbook on ODS Legislation and Import / Export Licensing System” to enable it to better achieve its goals?
10. Please give additional comments about the quality of the course and how similar courses could be improved.
Train-the-Trainers Workshop for Customs Officers on Monitoring & Control of ODS Imports & Exports
Port of Spain, Trinidad, 3-5 October 2000

CUSTOMS WORKSHOP EVALUATION TRINIDAD & TOBAGO
(19 of 19 questionnaires returned)

0 = POOR 2 3 4 5 = EXCELLENT

[Bar chart showing evaluation results for questions Q1 to Q7]