WORKSHOP REPORT

Train-the-Trainer Workshop for Customs Officers on

Import, Monitoring & Control Of Ozone Depleting Substances

organised by

the United Nations Environment Programme
&
the Government of the Republic of Maldives

in cooperation with

the World Customs Organization
&
The National Academy of Customs Excise & Narcotics, India

Male, Maldives 16th-18th August 2004
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary 3  
1. Background 5  
2. Objectives 8  
3. Expected results 9  
4. Participants 10  
5. Methodology 10  
6. Contents and structure of the workshop 12  
7. Results and lessons learned 13  
8. Follow-up action plan 15  
9. Evaluation by participants 16  
10. Annexures 17  

Annex 10.1 Workshop Agenda and resource materials 17  
Annex 10.2 List of participants 23  
Annex 10.3 List of Resource persons 24  
Annex 10.4 Workshop recommendations 25  
Annex 10.5 Evaluation by participants 25
Executive Summary

Realising the consequences of the depletion of the Ozone layer to mankind and the environment, the developing countries have just started phasing out ozone depleting substances (ODS) in line with the phase-out schedules agreed upon by the Parties of the Montreal Protocol (MP) on substances which deplete the Ozone Layer. Amongst the most commonly used ODS - Chlorofluorocarbons (CFCs) are used mainly as refrigerants. The first control measure taken to phaseout the ODS was to freeze the production and consumption at an average level of 1995-1997 starting from 1 July 1999 .The developing countries are preparing for a 50% reduction starting from 1 January 2005. However, the process of phasing out ODS is endangered by the illegal trade in ODS and ODS-containing products which is developing due to the scarcity of controlled substances and the high cost of switching over to alternative non ODS technologies. Recognizing the serious threat to the smooth phase out created by illegal trade in ODS, in 1997 the parties to the MP signed the Montreal Amendment to the MP which introduced a licensing system for ODS imports and exports. This was made mandatory for all Parties, which are signatories to the amendment.

Maldives is an importer and consumer of ODS, which are basically used in the airconditioning and refrigeration equipments used in Fishery and Tourism industry. The Government of Maldives has drawn up the phaseout schedule of ODS as per the MP. Preventing development of illegal trade in ODS in Maldives is crucial for ensuring smooth ODS phase out in the country.

The government of Maldives ratified not only the Vienna Convention on the protection of the ozone layer and the MP, but also all amendments to the MP including the Montreal Amendment, thus it was obliged not only to follow the ODS phase-out schedules, but also to establish a licensing system for ODS imports and exports. The Licensing system, which meets the substantial requirements specified in the Montreal Amendment, was introduced in Maldives on 1st April 2004.

Effective enforcement of the system depends on the awareness of the officers of the relevant government agencies which execute monitoring and control of ODS import and export. The crucial agency involved in control of trade in ODS is Customs, so extensive training of Customs Officers is needed to ensure prevention of illegal trade in ODS. Such training activities have been envisaged as part of the Technical Assistance component of the Refrigeration Management Plan (RMP) of the Government of Maldives in collaboration with UNEP.

Following that approach, the Government of Maldives in collaboration with UNEP and in cooperation with the World Customs Organization and the National Academy of Customs, Excise & Narcotics, India organized this three day Train-the-Trainers Workshop at Male from 16th -18th August 2004 (The Agenda for the Workshop is given in Annex 10.1). The participants of that workshop were senior and middle management level Customs Officers from Maldives Customs. Mr. Ashok K Mehta and Mr. Manoj K Arora, experienced trainers of the National Academy of Customs Excise and Narcotics, India (NACEN), in close coordination with Ms Ludgarde Coppens,
an international expert, UNEP DTIE, Bangkok imparted the skills on monitoring and control of ODS. This was the second workshop in pursuance to the MOU signed between NACEN India and UNEP to build the capacity of Customs officers and other national stakeholders in the Asia Pacific region. The workshop consisted of a 3-day standard training module designed specifically to build the capacity of the participants and to extend their knowledge and skills on import monitoring and control of Ozone Depleting Substances, so as to enable them to conduct the training courses for other officers and national stakeholders themselves. The lists of participants and the list of trainers, speakers and invitees are given in Annexes 10.2 and 10.3, respectively.

The workshop was inaugurated by Mr. Mohamed Saeed, Deputy Minister of Tourism, Government of Maldives, after the recitation of the Holy Quran. Mr. Ibrahim Zuhair, Chief of Customs (Executive Director) Government of Maldives, Mr. Mohamed Ali, Director, Environment Research Centre (ERC) along with other senior Customs officials graced the inauguration ceremony. In his address the Minister for Tourism said that Maldives has a booming food processing industry besides the flourishing tourism sector. Both these areas depend on refrigeration and air conditioning equipment. He stated the determination of the Maldives government in ensuring that the refrigeration industry is made free of CFCs as per their country’s commitment under the Montreal Protocol. The Director General of Customs in his address stated that the Customs organisation is ready to take on the responsibility of checking the illegal trade of ODS. Dr. Ali, while welcoming the participants said that the ERC is getting full support and cooperation from all the agencies of the government in implementation of the Protocol.

The workshops were structured on the pattern of the Phase I train-the-trainers for Customs officers’ module of UNEP. The agenda of the workshop held at Male from 16th -18th August 2004 and the resource materials handed out to the participants are included to this report as Annex 10.1. The individual participant’s package contained the “Country Handbook Maldives on import, monitoring and Control of ODS” prepared by the Environment Research Centre (ERC), Maldives and the UNEP’s Customs Training Manual “Saving the Ozone Layer”. Most of the presentations made for the workshops and the special binder prepared by NACEN expert Trainers contained the extensive reference materials on issues related to the subjects discussed at the workshop. A CD containing Country handbook, concept note, all presentations of the faculty, video films-‘Every Action Counts’, ‘Unfinished Business’ and ‘Lost in Transit’, was given to each participant. The video films on ozone layer depletion and on illegal trade in ODS were also shown to the participants during the workshop.

During the workshop most of the participants were very proactive and seemed committed to the issues presented to them. Based on extensive discussions carried out in the working groups at the Break-out session and in plenary, the participants developed a comprehensive set of valuable recommendations suggesting improvements to the existing system of monitoring and control of ODS in Male and to the execution of that system in practice. The participants as part of the recommendations also proposed an action plan for the Phase II and III of customs training in Maldives. The recommendations are included in this report as Annex 10.4.

The results of the workshop evaluation made by the participants showed that the workshop was highly appreciated by them. The overall evaluation of the workshop was excellent. Very encouraging evaluation results were obtained with regard to the questions concerning the
usefulness of the course, and the training materials as well as to the presentations and breakout sessions, which received quite high ratings. (The details of evaluations are given in Annex 10.5)

Ms Fathimath Sheereen Abdullah, Deputy Minister for Atoll Development, Government of Maldives awarded the certificates to the participants on the conclusion of the workshop. She stated that the government would ensure that all the refrigeration and air-conditioning equipment required for the new atolls being developed would be CFC free. She also offered to set up an exclusive research centre for environmental studies particularly in context of an atoll-country like Maldives. Mr. K D Ahmad Manik, Deputy Minister of Construction and Public Works, Government of Maldives and Mr. Ibrahim Zuhair, Executive Director, Maldives Customs Service also graced the occasion. An ODS identifier kit was also formally handed over to the Executive Director of Customs marking the preparedness of Maldives Customs to effectively monitor and control the trade of ODS. Dr Ali thanked all the participants and said that all the suggestions given during the workshop will be put up to the government and necessary changes in the policy and its implementation will be made.

Media coverage of the workshop was excellent. The representatives of the main Maldives newspapers and radio/TV programmes were present during the opening ceremony and valediction ceremony of the workshop. This enhanced the public awareness about the importance of the ozone layer to the environment and the efforts made by the international community and the Government of Maldives in monitoring and control of Ozone Depleting Sustances.

1. Background

The scientists, in mid eighties, found that the Ozone Layer that surrounds the Earth and absorbs a large part of the harmful uv-B radiation from the sun had been seriously depleted by the man-made chemicals, later called ozone depleting substances (ODS). Recognizing the threat of ozone layer depletion to the life on Earth the international community decided to sign the Vienna Convention for the Protection of the Ozone Layer in 1985 and the Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer (MP) in 1987. While developed countries have already phased out most of the ODS, developing countries are still using them, mostly in the Refrigeration and Air Conditioning (RAC) sector. According to the phase-out schedules agreed upon by the Parties of the MP developing countries had to freeze their production and consumption of the main ODS – chlorofluorocarbons (CFCs) – starting from 1 July 1999. The next step will be 50% reduction of production and consumption of those chemicals starting from 1 January 2005. The phase out schedules for other ODS (halons, carbon tetrachloride, methyl chloroform, methyl bromide) have already begun or will begin in the near future. Even the intermediate substitutes for CFCs – hydrochlorofluorocarbons (HCFCs) that are now widely used will have to be phased out after some time. Compliance with the ODS phase out schedules set out in the MP is a great challenge for developing countries and achieving the required levels of reduction will need much effort from developing countries and financial assistance from developed countries. Moreover, the process of phasing out ODS in both developed and developing countries has been seriously endangered by the illegal trade in ODS and ODS-containing products which increases the market demand for ODS, in particular for CFCs which are used mostly in the RAC sector. Monitoring and control of ODS traffic has become
inevitable to prevent that illegal trade. In view of this, in 1997 the parties to the MP decided to sign the Montreal Amendment to the MP where the establishment of the licensing system designed to monitor and control imports and exports of ODS was included as mandatory requirement for signatories of that treaty.

Maldives is a Developing Country, under Article 5 of the Protocol, and has ratified the Vienna Convention, Montreal Protocol, London amendment, Copenhagen amendment, Montreal amendment and Beijing amendment. Maldives does not produce any ozone depleting substances (ODS). All of its requirements of ODS are met through imports. Based on the consumption of ODS in 1995-1997 which was estimated to be 13.7 MT, the baseline for Maldives was established at 4.6 tonnes. The ODSs imported into the country are chlorofluorocarbons (CFCs), hydrochlorofluorocarbons (HCFCs), with the bulk of the imports being CFCs and HCFCs. Maldives imports minor quantities of halons, carbon tetrachloride and methyl chloroform. Almost all imports of CFCs and of HCFCs are used in refrigeration and air conditioning industry.

Maldives has a vibrant tourism and seafood related industry. Maldives has about 87 tourist resorts and a significant fishing and seafood processing industry. These two industries are vital for economic growth in the country. The Tourism Industry in the food and beverage sector and in room air conditioning consumes ODSs. Room air conditioning systems are based on HCFC-22. The food and beverage area uses large storage systems for storing food products (primarily vegetables, meat, milk products and fish) and smaller systems such as chest freezers for storing drinks etc.

Maldives has a significant number of mobile air conditioning equipment used in cars, refrigerated trucks, refrigerated shipping vessels used for fishing etc. The majority of these equipments use ODSs. There were 651 ODS based cars and trucks in Maldives in 2000. The Government of Maldives has imposed a regulation banning imports of vehicles older than 5 years. This has resulted in an increase in non-ODS based equipment into the country, as more recent models are being imported. Maldives consumed 4.59 MT of annexure A ODS in 2000.

1.2 Institutional Framework of Maldives for monitoring and control of ODS:

The Ministry of Home Affairs and Environment is responsible for the implementation of the Montreal Protocol in the Republic of Maldives and to oversee the implementation of the Ozone related projects. The Environment Research Centre (ERC), of the Ministry of Home Affairs and Environment acts as the National Coordinator on programs in drawing up policies and devising administrative measures for the implementation of the Montreal Protocol in the Maldives. Since the Maldives is not a producer of any ODS, the phase-out of these substances pertain mainly to controlling ODS importation and usage. The Ministry of Trade and Industry and the Customs Authorities supply information to the National Ozone Unit (NOU) on the import/export of ODS on a tri-annual basis. The Licensing system and regulations on ODS are implemented by the ERC in close coordination with the Ministry of Trade and Industries and Maldivian Customs.
1.3 Legislative Framework

The Environmental Protection and Preservation Act of Maldives (4/93) is the basic regulation for the protection and preservation of the Environment. The Ministry of Home Affairs and Environment (MHAE) is the focal point for implementation of this Act as well as the development of policies, regulations and guidelines under this Act and plays a prominent role in the overall enforcement procedures. The Ministry of Home Affairs, Housing and Environment is given certain statutory powers for the enforcement of the Environmental Protection and Preservation Act.

Regulations on ODS trade restrictions, control measures and ODS import licensing system is developed in close coordination with the Ministry of Trade and Industries. The Environment Research Centre of the MHAE, the Maldives Customs Services, the Ministry of Trade and Industries and the National Security Services jointly enforce these regulations.

1.4 ODS Import Licensing System

The ODS import licensing system was enforced in Maldives with effect from 1st April 2002 by the Ministry of Trade and Industries. As per this system the ozone-depleting chemicals are allowable for import without registering at the Ministry of Home Affairs and Environment and the licenses are required to be renewed annually.

1.5 Regulations to monitor and control ODS in Maldives

- In 2002 Maldives was found to be noncompliant of the Montreal Protocol as the total ODS consumption exceeded the baseline. Therefore, the government initiated a concerted Action Plan, and took over the CFC-12 stock from the importer, started reselling CFC-12 and banned import of CFC-12 from 15th April 2004 until December 2005.
- In January 2003 legislation banning the importation of four ODS substances namely Halons (1211, 1301, 2402) Methyl Chloroform, Bromo Chloromethane, and Methyl Bromide became effective.
- In January 2004 a regulation banning the importation of equipment containing CFC-11 and CFC-12 became effective.

1.6 Refrigerant Management Plan (RMP)

The Multilateral Fund approved a Refrigerant Management Plan (RMP) of Maldives, in November 2002, to ensure the cost effective phase out of ODS based equipment in Maldives. The RMP was aimed at formulating the integrated approach to the phase out Programme in the refrigeration maintenance sector which is the main user of ODS in the country.
1.7 Illegal Trade and capacity building of Customs Officers

The Parties to the Protocol have recognized the risks arising out of illegal trade in Ozone Depleting Substances and Ozone Depleting Substances based equipments and products and adopted decisions on licensing systems and customs training. The Multilateral Fund has been responding to these challenges by approving customs training in the developing countries since 1998. Building capacity of Customs Officials who are at the forefront of every country’s efforts to combat illegal trade is vital and training is a key component of capacity building.

1.8 Customs Training under UNEP DTIE Ozone Action:

UNEP has taken the lead in designing customs training and is the principal Implementing Agency to undertake this activity at present, as part of its overall role as a policy advisor to A5 country governments. UNEP’s training activities under the Ozone Action programme - Compliance Assistance Programme (CAP) build skills for implementing and managing phase-out activities and are conducted at the regional and national level.

UNEP is building long term partnerships with local/regional institutions that are being developed as Centres of Excellence to deliver its training programmes on a regional basis. Ozone Action has identified certain regional and local training institutions and is in the process of building their capacity. On a pilot basis, the National Academy of Customs, Excise and Narcotics (NACEN) of India has been identified for delivering Customs training in other countries of the region.

Customs agencies and other enforcement bodies play an essential role in the effective monitoring and control of import/export licensing mechanisms, in the collection of import/export data, in the enforcement of ODS regulations and in the prevention of illegal trade.

In order to effectively implement and enforce a given regulatory regime, customs agencies must be made familiar with any legislative and regulatory mechanisms that require their attention. Moreover, the national stakeholders need to address the Meeting of Parties’ Decision XIV / 7 on issues relating to tackling illegal trade.

To achieve this objective, the training programme for customs officers aims at –

(1) Enabling customs officers to control and monitor the imports and exports of CFC refrigerants as well as other ODS and
(2) Assisting the country to comply with the freeze and phase-out Schedules for ODS under the Montreal Protocol.
2. Objectives of the Workshop:

The main objective of this training programme was to provide the customs, and other stakeholders in Maldives with the skills necessary to monitor and control the imports of CFCs and other ODS products / equipment. The detection and prevention of illegal trade is part of this effort. These were to be achieved by:

I. Increasing awareness of ozone depletion issues.
II. Familiarising Customs Officers with the different types of ODS being used in the sector and the applications for which they are used.
III. Familiarising Customs Officers with the provisions and phase-out schedules of the Montreal Protocol and its amendments.
IV. Providing the officers with an understanding of the national RMP.
V. Providing an overview of the newly established licensing system for ODS and its implications for customs officers and other stakeholder agencies.
VI. Presenting the revised customs codes which allow for the identification of ODS and ODS products / equipment.
VII. Refining and optimising the establishment of the operational details of the monitoring and control system for ODS.
VIII. Providing an overview of customs regulations and monitoring and control systems for ODS in other countries in the region.
IX. Training officers of the customs on the use of identification equipment for refrigerants.
X. Designing the concept, agenda, strategy and the time schedule for the training of the remaining customs officers in the country.
XI. Provide an opportunity for the stake-holders to network with each other so that necessary coordination is achieved at the field level.

3. Expected Results:

The immediate result will be the availability of trained customs trainers and key stakeholders and the development of a training approach and recommendations for the subsequent Phase II training of customs and enforcement officers in Maldives.

A Montreal Protocol related training module will be included in the ongoing training programmes for new customs officers and will also be integrated in the refresher courses for experienced officers. Thus the sustainability of the training programme will be ensured.

The long-term result is to enhance awareness of ozone depletion issues among customs authorities and other relevant stakeholders as well as the achievements of the objectives as stated in Section 2.
In addition, synergies for the enforcement of other relevant international environmental agreements such as the Basel Convention, CITES, Rotterdam Convention and the Kyoto Protocol will be created. The success of most international environmental agreements will depend on the continued support of the world’s customs authorities and other key stakeholders.

4. Participants

The train-the-trainers workshop was designed for 20 to 25 participants. 21 participants attended the 3-day workshop in Male (Maldives)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of Participants</th>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Senior Customs Officers</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Customs Officers</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Assistant Customs Officers</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The complete list of participants is attached as Annex 10.2.

5. Methodology

The training programme is to be implemented in three phases:

Phase 1: Train-the-trainers workshop for Customs Officers

The train-the-trainers workshop for customs and other enforcement officers in Maldives is implemented as part of a national RMP. More than 72 similar workshops have been held in other developing countries. The design of the programme requires that an ODS import/export
licensing system and related ODS regulations are in place before the train-the-trainers workshop starts. Decision IX/8 of the Ninth Meeting of the Conference of Parties made the establishment of such licensing system mandatory to the Montreal Protocol.

The Country handbook of Maldives on “Monitoring and control of Ozone Depleting Substances” prepared by the NOU (ERC) and the UNEP training manual "Customs Officer Training on Substances Depleting the Ozone Layer” formed the basic training material for the participants. Specific sessions on various aspects related to the objectives were taken by the resource persons. The material was specially moderated to suit the specific situation of Maldives.

Time was allocated for short presentations by the participants to test their training skills and also to demonstrate before them the required qualities of a good trainer. They were also exposed to the concept of Systematic Approach to Training to enable them to enhance their capability for training.

The project preparation followed a participatory approach and involved a number of local resource persons. Some case studies on smuggling schemes were also presented to test participants’ knowledge of what they had learned throughout the workshop and four small working groups were created during the breakout session in order to discuss specific topics. Each group prepared a report with their findings and recommendations.

During group discussions, which were specifically included in the workshop, the participants were given inputs to plan the Phase II and III of the training programme and prepare detailed recommendations, a tentative concept note, agenda and implementation schedule.

A practical hands-on session was included in the programme to identify different types of refrigerants using the pressure-temperature method, leak detector and digital refrigerant identifier. Product and packaging labels were also shown to the participants. Refrigerant identifiers as well as ODS, examples of ODS packaging and ODS products / equipment were made available for demonstration purposes.

Wrap-up sessions were held at the end of every day and the participants conducted a workshop evaluation and agreed a final set of recommendations.

Each participant was awarded a “Certificate of Participation” from the Government of the Republic of Maldives.

**Phase II:** Subsequent training of the remaining customs and enforcement officers in the country

The remaining customs and enforcement officers in the country will be trained by the trained customs trainers who have participated in the Phase I training. Phase II of the training programme will take into account the recommendations from the train-the-trainers workshops and be based on the "UNEP Customs Training Manual".
A certain number of experienced customs officers may receive training on ozone-related issues as part of the continuous customs re-training programme.

The Customs department will be expected to incorporate a Montreal Protocol training module on control and monitoring of ODS in its curriculum to ensure that future customs officers are trained on this aspect. This will be done within the ongoing training activities of the customs department.

The NOU (ERC), the customs department and the local legal consultant will be responsible for the implementation of Phase II training.

**Phase III: Monitoring & evaluation**

The NOU (ERC) shall co-ordinate, monitor and follow-up on the Phase II and III training. After completion of Phase II of the training programme, the NOU will evaluate the results of the training programme and prepare a follow-up & evaluation report.

**6. Content and structure of the train-the-trainers workshop.**

The training materials and the workshop agenda were designed to ensure that the objectives set out for the training programme are achieved.

The workshop agenda included sessions on the following topics:

1. Ozone layer depletion
2. International response
3. National obligations and response
4. National import / export licensing system
5. Checking papers, forms and permits
6. Related international conventions and Green Customs Initiative
7. Global & regional context of Trade in ODS
8. Role of Customs Officers and other key stakeholders
9. Illegal trade with ODS and ODS-containing equipment and goods
10. Identification of ODS and ODS-containing equipment
11. Practical exercises on identification of ODS
12. Safe handling, transport and storage of ODS
13. Breakout Session
14. Action planning for Phase II and III of the customs training
15. Workshop evaluation.
16. Training Methodology

During the workshop three videos, namely, ‘Every Action Counts’, ‘Unfinished Business’ and ‘Lost in Transit’ were shown to the participants. Time was allocated for discussions among the
participants on further implementation of the RMP and the implementation of Phase II and III of the training programme.

Each day a discussion session was held to draw conclusions and make recommendations for adoption during the last day of the workshop. The detailed Agenda is listed in Annexure

7. Results and lessons learned

The detailed objectives set out for the workshop were fully met through the appropriate design of the workshop agenda during which the 18 workshop sessions addressed all relevant issues. A detailed evaluation of the most relevant issues is included in Annex 10.5.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OBJECTIVES SET OUT</th>
<th>RESULTS ACHIEVED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Increasing awareness of ozone depletion issues</td>
<td>Through Session 1 and the video films</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Familiarizing Customs officers with the different types of ODS being used in different sectors and for different applications</td>
<td>Through Sessions 1,10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Familiarizing Customs officers with the provisions and phase-out schedules of the Montreal Protocol and its Amendments and with related international conventions,</td>
<td>Through Sessions 2,6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Providing officers with understanding of the national obligations and response with regard to monitoring and control of ODS</td>
<td>Through Session 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Providing an overview on the national licensing and quota system for ODS and its implications for customs officers</td>
<td>Through Session 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Presenting the revised HS customs codes for ODS and products containing them and pointing out the problems in identification of ODS/ODS-containing products</td>
<td>Through Session 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. Related international Conventions and the Green Customs Initiative</td>
<td>Through Session 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII. Providing an overview of regional context of the monitoring and control system for ODS and discussing the most popular ODS smuggling schemes</td>
<td>Through Sessions 5,7,8,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX. Training in the use of identification equipment for refrigerants</td>
<td>Through Session 10,11,12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X. Designing the basic elements of the training of the remaining customs officers in the country.</td>
<td>Through Sessions 13-18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In addition, the following specific outcomes were achieved:

- Successful training and certification of 21 participants on import, monitoring and control of imports and exports of ODS and ODS products/equipment. This training of the selected
customs officers of Maldives should be a major help in preventing the illegal trade in ODS in the region.
- Providing the participants with skills and knowledge needed to attend the advanced part of the course
- Explaining and demonstrating methods of identification of ODS refrigerants and suggesting the right approach to checking freight papers and permits.
- Demonstrating the photos of various ODS containers and the smart methods used to smuggle ODS
- Exchange of information and experiences between the participants and development of a network of personal contacts
- Detailed workshop recommendations by the participants containing, inter alia more power to Customs officers on search and seizure, (see Annex 10.5).
- Certification of the participants by the Government of Maldives, NACEN, India and UNEP

The following lessons were learned from the workshops held in Male (Maldives)

- The workshop conducted in Male demonstrated how important the proper selection of the participants can be for the real success of the workshop. Good proportion between Senior and middle level Customs Officers enabled the discussions to be really focused on the most important issues. However, great differences in the ability of the participants to absorb and deeply understand the material given to them were observed when the instructors checked their skills and knowledge at the interactive sessions. This could result both from the different background of the participants and from their individual skills. It should be emphasised here that though it is anticipated by UNEP that all participants of the train-the-trainers courses will be the trainers in the future, it will obviously never happen because not all people have got the teaching skills and unless the selection of participants is made after preliminary tests showing those skills, only very few of the trainees can be good trainers themselves. Therefore, the request of Director ERC and Executive Director Customs Maldives to identify the most promising group of future trainers was definitely right.

- It is suggested that in the future workshops, the participants should be requested to give very short presentations on the topics discussed at the workshop. Two possible approaches are possible here. One is that the topics would be randomly drawn by the participants, so nobody would know in advance which topic he/she is going to talk about. In that case, time for a talk should be very short – max. 3 minutes. This approach would give the instructor the idea of level of understanding the topics discussed at the workshop, but would not allow for judgement of the teaching skills of the participant. Another approach can be that the participants know about their topics in advance and have some time for preparing their presentations. In that case, the presentations can be longer – 5-7 minutes. That approach would give the instructor an idea of the teaching skills of the participants, but would not allow for testing the level of understanding the material. The suggestions presented here can be implemented only in the combined (5-day) workshops because otherwise time for such test would not be available in the agenda.
- It should be emphasised that the activity of the participants of both workshops measured by number of questions asked and proactive approach to discussions in the plenary and in the breakout session was really outstanding. This was the general impression of the instructors, but obviously the activity of the individuals was not equal – see the observations presented above.

- Presentation of audiovisual aids (video films, real pictures of seized containers etc.) at the workshop helped much in absorbing the attention of the audience and in understanding the issues discussed at the workshop. It is then recommended that such approach is always taken in the future workshops. Also it should be pointed out that a thoughtful design of the contents of the individual participant’s package is very important for the success of any customs training workshop. The participants appreciated the choice of materials prepared for the workshop, in particular they liked the idea of including a CD with the presentations and films and a booklet with resource study materials that would help them in their future service as trainers.

- Discussions on illegal trade in ODS from the regional perspective seem to be very important for the success of any customs training workshop. Presentation by the Sh Ali Mahir on the various modus operandi of smuggling detected by the Maldivian Customs invited lot of appreciation.

- Introducing the panel discussion on ODS customs codes to the workshop programme appeared to be very useful to the participants since the discussion revealed some inconsistencies in the current customs codes.

8. Follow-up action plan

Maldives is implementing a major project in collaboration with UNEP on training Customs officers and other stakeholders under the Refrigerant Management Plan (RMP) and preparing a strategy for policy on training. The objective of this project is to assist the Government of Maldives to formulate a strategy and an action plan for implementation and enforcement of all the policies and regulations related to ODS phase-out including a strategy for customs officers training in Maldives.

The participation of senior and middle level Customs officers and other key stakeholders from Maldives at the workshop gave Maldives an insight into preparing both the Phase I and subsequent phases of training of customs officers in the country. It has been recommended that these trained officers will take a lead in organisation of the training.

It has also been suggested that the ERC will consider and, as far as possible, take care of implementation of workshop recommendations for further training and also of the other recommendations as adopted by the workshop participants (see Annex 10.4). The recommendations will also be communicated to the relevant decision-makers and politicians, and their support requested.
9. Evaluation by participants

The overall evaluation of the workshop (Q1) was excellent and the “excellent” rating very distinctly prevailed (93.33%). Except for six participants all rated this workshop as excellent. Outstanding evaluation results were received with regard to the question concerning the course information and the training materials and the evaluation was 97.14% and 94.28%. The communication between the participants and composition of the participants was evaluated at 88.6% and 82.9% respectively.

The evaluation with regard to various sessions has also been outstanding and the same has been tabulated sessions wise in the chart given below. The evaluation of the international faculty ranged from 96.17% to 85.71% and the evaluation of the local resource persons varied from 90.5% to 82.9%.

The highest number of “excellent” and “very good” marks was given to the following issues: Ozone layer science, international response, identification of ODS and ODS-containing equipment and other goods, safe handling, illegal trade and data reporting. Based on the comments given in the evaluation questionnaires it is evident that the participants were highly appreciative of the course content, knowledge and communicative skills of the trainers. The excellent quality of presentations of participants on the topics of the lectures delivered by the trainers reflected the high quantum of retention of their knowledge and the application of the same in context to their country.

The tabulated presentation of the evaluation questionnaires received from the workshop participants concerning the workshop itself, the UNEP “Training Manual for Customs Officers” is included in Annex 10.5.
10. ANNEXURES

Annex 10.1 Workshop Agenda and resource materials
Annex 10.2 List of participants
Annex 10.3 List of Resource persons
Annex 10.4 Workshop recommendations
Annex 10.5 Evaluation by participants

10.1 Workshop Agenda and resource materials

AGENDA

Day 1

08:30 Registration of participants

09:00 Inauguration of the Workshop
  • Recitation of Holy Quran
  • Welcome speech by Dr. Mohammed Ali
  • Workshop Intro by Dr. Ludgarde Coppens
  • Speech by the Chief Guest and guests of Honour
  • Tea

09:45 Break for Media briefing, Ozone Officer, National Ozone Unit

10:00 Introduction, Manoj k Arora
  - Introduction of the faculty
  - Ice-Breaking for the participants
  - Linking course to the world situation
  - Objective of the Course
  - Outline of the Course
  - Questions and answers

10:30 UNEP video film – Every Action Counts

10:45 Session 1: Ozone layer depletion, Ashok K Mehta
  - Ozone layer science
  - Environmental and human health consequences
  - Discussion
11:30  **Session 2: International response, Ludgarde Coppens.**
- International response - the Montreal Protocol and its Amendments
- Phase-out schedule and strategies for Article 2 and Article 5 countries
- Discussion

12.30  Lunch

13.30  **Session 3: National obligations and response, Mahmood Riyaz-Assistant Director, Coastal Management**
- Overview of national ODS consumption pattern
- National phase-out obligations
- National response - Refrigerant Management Plan
- Data Reporting

14.15  **Session 4: National import/export licensing system, Musthafa Luthufee, Senior Customs Officer Gr I**
- Institutional framework
- National ODS regulations
- Structure of national import/export licensing system
- Institutional arrangements and procedures to manage the system
- Import quotas and application for permits and allowances
- Information to importers, wholesalers and end-users
- Handling of seized ODS and ODS-containing equipment and goods
- Enforcement and penalties
- Forms introduced by the licensing system

15.00  **Licensing System-Experience in India, Manoj K Arora**

15.30  Break

15:45  **Session 5: Checking papers, forms and permits, Customs Representative from Maldives**
- Application forms, permit forms, freight papers, retrofit certificates etc.
- Practical exercise on checking freight papers and permits
- Discussion

16:30  Wrap-up sessions

**Day 2**

08.30  **Session 6: Presentations by selected participants to assess their training skills**

09:00  **Session 7: Related International Conventions and Green Customs Initiative, Ms Lud Coppens**
- CITES
- Kyoto Protocol
- Basel Convention
- Rotterdam Convention
- Lusaka Agreement
- Common features related to the control of trade and synergies for customs authorities for effective enforcement
- Conclusions on Synergies on Co-operation between related conventions.
- Green Customs Initiative
- Discussion

09.45 Session 8: Global and regional context of ODS trade, Ashok K Mehta.
- Global production and trade with ODS and ODS-containing products
- Transshipment harbours, production, disposal, reclaim facilities in the region
- Regional and global trade agreements
- Impact on trade and economy - trade representative
- Discussion

10:30 Break

10.45 Session 9: Illegal trade in ODS and ODS-containing equipment and goods, Manoj K Arora
- Legal and illegal trade with Parties and non-Parties
- Detecting legal and illegal trade at local, regional and international level
- Trade with recycled, recovered, reclaimed or contaminated refrigerants
- Causes and trends of illegal trade
- Methods of smuggling
- Prevention of illegal trade
- Case study on illegal trade
- Discussion

11.30 Session 10: Role of customs officers and other key stakeholders, Ashok K Mehta
- Key players in monitoring and control imports / exports of ODS and ODS-containing equipment and goods (customs, coast guard, police, court, chemistry laboratory, importers/wholesalers, end-users, NOU etc)
- Data reporting
- Reporting legal and illegal trade with ODS and ODS-containing products
- Enforcing ODS legislation
- Checklist for customs officers
- Discussion

12.00 EIA Video (Lost in Transit/Nothing to Declare)

12.30 Lunch
13.30  Session 11: Identification of ODS and ODS-containing equipments and goods,

    Manoj K Arora

    - Harmonized System codes for pure and mixed ODS
    - Common trade names for ODS, including CFCs, HCFCs, methyl bromide, halons, solvents, foams, aerosols etc.)
    - CAS numbers, ASHRAE numbers, UN numbers etc.
    - Examples of labeling for ODS and colour codes
    - Examples of labeling of ODS-containing equipment and goods
    - Detection of mislabeled ODS containers, cylinders etc.
    - Identification of ODS-containing equipment and goods
    - Use of refrigerant identifiers (theory)
    - Discussion

14.30 - Session 12: Use of Refrigerant Identifiers (Theory), Ashok K Mehta

14.45 - Break

15.00 - Session 13: Practical exercises on identification of ODS,

    Ashok K Mehta, Manoj K Arora

    - Examples of ODS containers and cylinders and ODS-containing equipment and goods
    - Hands-on work with CFC detection equipment if available
    - Identification of ODS-containing equipment and goods

16.15 - UNEP Video (“Montreal Protocol” – celebrating our success Sept’97) or EIA Video (“Unfinished Business”)

16.30 - Introduction to breakout Sessions (Session 14), Ashok K Mehta, Manoj K Arora

    - Selection of Topics and Groups
    - Effective operation of ODS import / export licensing system.
    - Enforcement of ODS regulations
    - In addition to two key topics, participants may select 2 additional topics.
      * Topic 3: Training strategy in Phase II
      * Topic 4: Challenges in combating Illegal Trade

17:00  Wrap-up session and workshop recommendations

Day 3

09:00 - Session 15: Safe handling, transport and storage of ODS,

    Manoj K Arora

    - ODS Chemical information relevant to customs officers
    - Safe handling of ODS and ODS-containing products
- Safe transport and storage of ODS and ODS-containing products
- Safe sampling of ODS - who is allowed to take samples and to use refrigerant identifiers
- Discussion

9:30 - Break-out Session (16): Effective operation of ODS import / export licensing system and enforcement of ODS regulations

- Group moderators will co-ordinate the breakout sessions.
- Group moderators will ensure the preparation of a short report and presentation of their findings including the group recommendations.

11:00 - Break

11:15 - Break-out Session (17): Presentation of findings of the group work to the plenary
- Hand-over of reports to the lead consultant
- Presentation of group recommendations to the plenary (10 min per group)
- Discussion and adoption of group recommendations (5 min per group)
- Feedback on the breakout session

13:00 - Lunch

14:00 - Session 18: Systematic Approach to Training (SAT),

*Manoj K Arora.*

- Theory and Concept of SAT
- How to design an effective Training Program
- Identification of Training Objectives
  - Management of Training Programs
  - Learning Process of Adult Trainees
  - Discussion

14:30 - Session 19: Action planning for Phase II and III of the Customs training,

*Manoj K Arora, Ashok K Mehta, Lud Coppens*

- How to design Phase II of the customs training (approach, duration, agenda, schedule, trainers, participants etc.
- Which training materials should be used for Phase II of the customs training and what should be the key contents of the training.
  - How to ensure timely implementation, monitoring and reporting during Phase II and III
  - Discussion

15:00 - Session 20: Workshop evaluation, *NOU Officer, Manoj K Arora, Ashok K Mehta,*

- Completion of evaluation questionnaires
- General feedback and comments from participants and organizers
15:45 - Break

16:00 - **Closing session**

- Workshop Summary, Lud Coppens
- Address by Dr. M Ali, ERC
- Vote of Thanks by Ashok Mehta, Manoj K Arora
## ANNEX 10.2  List of participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>DESIGNATION</th>
<th>CONTACT No.</th>
<th>E-MAIL ADDRESS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ali Mahir</td>
<td>Senior Customs Officer Grade 2</td>
<td>749919</td>
<td><a href="mailto:alimahir@avasmail.com.mv">alimahir@avasmail.com.mv</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Adam Shafeeq</td>
<td>Senior Customs Officer Grade 2</td>
<td>312210</td>
<td><a href="mailto:a_shafyg@hotmail.com">a_shafyg@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Mohamed Riyaz Moosa</td>
<td>Senior Customs Officer Grade 2</td>
<td>709509</td>
<td><a href="mailto:m_riyaz_m@hotmail.com">m_riyaz_m@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Rameez Ali</td>
<td>Senior Customs Officer Grade 1</td>
<td>716651</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ramittey@hotmail.com">ramittey@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Adam Latheef</td>
<td>Senior Customs Officer Grade 1</td>
<td>783446</td>
<td><a href="mailto:adamlatheef789@hotmail.com">adamlatheef789@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Ahmed Mohamed</td>
<td>Senior Customs Officer Grade 1</td>
<td>740570</td>
<td><a href="mailto:velidhooahmed@hotmail.com">velidhooahmed@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Hawwa Shifa</td>
<td>Senior Customs Officer Grade 1</td>
<td>766176</td>
<td><a href="mailto:hshifa@hotmail.com">hshifa@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Aminath Agila</td>
<td>Senior Customs Officer Grade 1</td>
<td>735233</td>
<td><a href="mailto:agila2002@hotmail.com">agila2002@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Mohamed Waheed</td>
<td>Customs Officer Grade 2</td>
<td>705591</td>
<td><a href="mailto:cheersforall@otmail.com">cheersforall@otmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Ahmed Fareed</td>
<td>Customs Officer Grade 2</td>
<td>706081</td>
<td><a href="mailto:farydu@hotmail.com">farydu@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Ahmed Hussain Fulhu</td>
<td>Customs Officer Grade 2</td>
<td>785895</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Moomina Rasheeda</td>
<td>Customs Officer Grade 2</td>
<td>830831</td>
<td><a href="mailto:moomina@customs.gov.mv">moomina@customs.gov.mv</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Aas Abdulla</td>
<td>Customs Officer Grade 2</td>
<td>766963</td>
<td><a href="mailto:garudhia@hotmail.com">garudhia@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Ahmed Mohamed Koi</td>
<td>Customs Officer Grade 2</td>
<td>740570</td>
<td><a href="mailto:ammood2@hotmail.com">ammood2@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Ahmed Shareef</td>
<td>Customs Officer Grade 2</td>
<td>762392</td>
<td><a href="mailto:sharyph2003@hotmail.com">sharyph2003@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Adam Adeem</td>
<td>Customs Officer Grade 2</td>
<td>762353</td>
<td><a href="mailto:adeem3923@hotmail.com">adeem3923@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Mohamed Latheef</td>
<td>Customs Officer Grade 2</td>
<td>755055</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Haroon Yoosuf</td>
<td>Customs Officer Grade 1</td>
<td>727242</td>
<td><a href="mailto:roon27@hotmail.com">roon27@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Ahmed Saeed</td>
<td>Customs Officer Grade 2</td>
<td>327009</td>
<td><a href="mailto:saitttey@hotmail.com">saitttey@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Saifulla Waseem</td>
<td>Assistant Customs Officer Grade2</td>
<td>777468</td>
<td><a href="mailto:chonklix@hotmail.com">chonklix@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Ismail Rasheed</td>
<td>Assistant Customs Officer Grade 2</td>
<td>738849</td>
<td><a href="mailto:kudasp@hotmail.com">kudasp@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## ANNEX 10.3. List of Resource Persons

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.NO.</th>
<th>NAME AND DESIGNATION</th>
<th>ADDRESS</th>
<th>TELEPHONE/ FAX NUMBER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Ashok Kumar Mehta Additional Commissioner</td>
<td>National Academy of Customs, Excise and Narcotics (NACEN) Sector-29, Faridabad, Haryana</td>
<td>0091-11-25623979(R) 0091-11-23370213(Off) 0091-11-23370577(F) <a href="mailto:akmehta1@yahoo.com">akmehta1@yahoo.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Manoj K Arora Additional Director</td>
<td>National Academy of Customs, Excise and Narcotics (NACEN) Sector-29, Faridabad, Haryana</td>
<td>0091-129-2504639(Off) 0091-129-2504632(F) 0091-120-2789791(R) <a href="mailto:manoj_k_arora@hotmail.com">manoj_k_arora@hotmail.com</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Ms. Lud Coppens</td>
<td>UNEP DTIE Bangkok</td>
<td><a href="mailto:coppensl@un.org">coppensl@un.org</a> 00-662-2881679 (off)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Mahmood Riyaz</td>
<td>ERC, MHAE, Maldives</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Riyaz55@hotmail.com">Riyaz55@hotmail.com</a> 00-960-787305 (off)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Musthafa Luthufee</td>
<td>Maldives Customs Academy, Maldives</td>
<td><a href="mailto:Mustho@customs.gov.mv">Mustho@customs.gov.mv</a> 00-960-747455 (off)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Dr. Mohammed Ali</td>
<td>Director, ERC, MHAE, Maldives</td>
<td>Em <a href="mailto:alec@yahoo.com">alec@yahoo.com</a> 00-960-335948 (off)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ANNEX 10.4  Workshop recommendations

1. The awareness level of the stakeholders in Maldives about the responsibilities is low. A comprehensive outreach programme should be undertaken for improving the awareness levels.
2. Penalties should be made leviable on the defaulters in the Licensing system as well as those indulging in illegal trading of ODS.
3. Impose a higher Customs Duty on ODS and products containing ODS.
4. A permanent Customs stamp should be placed on each cylinder of ODS which is imported into Maldives. This will help tracking the cylinders.
5. Refrigeration and Airconditioning experts engaged in servicing of equipment should be brought under the licensing regime.
6. The course material should be made available to the participants a few days in advance of the training workshop so that they are already prepared.
7. The training material should be bilingual, i.e. in English and the native language.
8. The trained trainers should be provided with refresher course and up-to-date material should be made available to them on an ongoing basis.

ANNEX 10.5  Evaluation by the participants

This annex concerns evaluation of the workshop by the participants summarised based on the evaluation questionnaires received.

Evaluation Questionnaire for the workshop

The following questionnaire was given to participants to evaluate the workshop. The responses are tabled in a graph at the end of this Annex. The rating “1” stands for poor performance and the rating “5” for excellent performance.

1. What is your overall evaluation of the course?
2. Did the course provide the information you expected?
3. Was the communication between participants possible and useful?
4. Was the composition of the audience adequate?
5. As far as the contents of the presentation are concerned, did you find them adequate in explaining the following issues:
   a) Environmental and human health consequences of ozone layer depletion?
   b) International response to ozone layer depletion (Montreal Protocol)?
c) National obligations and phase-out strategy (RMP)?

d) Regulatory framework for the national import/export licensing system?

e) Problem of illegal trade of ODS?

f) Role of customs officers in enforcing the import/export licensing system?

g) Role of other stakeholders in implementing the import/export licensing system?

h) How to identify ODS and equipment containing ODS and the use of ODS identifying equipment?

i) Issues relating to safe storage and handling of ODS?

j) Data reporting requirements and procedures?

k) Enforcement and penalties

6. Did the training course provide you with adequate information regarding the subsequent training of the remaining customs officers?

7. Did the training course provide appropriate training material as the basis for the subsequent training of the remaining customs officers?

8. Can you think of any additional material that should be included in the "UNEP Customs Training Manual" to enable it to better achieve its goals?

9. Can you think of any additional material that should be included in the "India Country Handbook on National Regulations and Import / Export Licensing System for Phasing out of ODS" to enable it to better achieve its goals?

10. Please give additional comments about the quality of the course and how similar courses could be improved.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl.No</th>
<th>Overall evaluation</th>
<th>Course Info</th>
<th>Communication Between participants</th>
<th>Composition of audience</th>
<th>Course information</th>
<th>Training material</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Ali Mahir</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Adam Shafeeq</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Mohamed Riyaz Moosa</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Rameez Ali</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Adam Latheef</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Ahmed Mohammed</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Hawwa Shifa</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Aminath Agila</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Mohamed Waheed</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Ahmed Fareed</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Ahmed Hussain Fulhu</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Moonima Rasheeda</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Aas Abdulla</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Ahmed Mohamed Koi</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Ahmed Shareef</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Adam Adeem</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Mohammed Latheef</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Haroon Yousuf</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Abdulla Saeed</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Saifulla Waseem</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Ismail Rasheed</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>98</strong></td>
<td><strong>102</strong></td>
<td><strong>93</strong></td>
<td><strong>87</strong></td>
<td><strong>98</strong></td>
<td><strong>99</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td><strong>93.33</strong></td>
<td><strong>97.14</strong></td>
<td><strong>88.57</strong></td>
<td><strong>82.85</strong></td>
<td><strong>93.33</strong></td>
<td><strong>94.28</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sl. No.</td>
<td>Env. health</td>
<td>Inter-National Response</td>
<td>National Obligation</td>
<td>Licensing System</td>
<td>Illegal Trade</td>
<td>Role of Custom Officers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Ali Mahir</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Adam Shafeeq</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Mohamed Riyaz Moosa</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Rameez Ali</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Adam Latheef</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Ahmed Mohammed</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Hawwa Shifa</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Aminath Agila</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Mohamed Waheed</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Ahmed Fareed</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Ahmed Hussain Fulhu</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Moonima Rasheeda</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Aas Abdulla</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Ahmed Mohamed Koi</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Ahmed Shareef</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Adam Adeem</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Haroon Yoosuf</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Abdulla Saeed</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Shaifulla Waseem</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Ismail Rasheed</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>101</strong></td>
<td><strong>101</strong></td>
<td><strong>90</strong></td>
<td><strong>92</strong></td>
<td><strong>95</strong></td>
<td><strong>97</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>%</strong></td>
<td><strong>96.19</strong></td>
<td><strong>96.19</strong></td>
<td><strong>85.71</strong></td>
<td><strong>87.61</strong></td>
<td><strong>90.47</strong></td>
<td><strong>92.38</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>